



Board Report 22-05

Date: January 18, 2022

To: Board of Deferred Compensation Administration
(Board)

From: Staff

Subject: Recruitment/Selection Process for DC Plan Manager

Board of Deferred Compensation Administration

Thomas Moutes
Chairperson

Raymond Ciranna
Vice-Chairperson

Robert Schoonover
First Provisional Chair

Neil Guglielmo
Second Provisional Chair

Joshua Geller
Third Provisional Chair

Linda P. Le
Wendy G. Macy

Baldemar J. Sandoval

Jeremy Wolfson

Recommendation:

That the Board: (a) request that staff work with the Ad Hoc DC Plan Manager Selection Committee to develop a work experience questionnaire, advisory essay, position and process outline, and interview questions, for use, as applicable, in the DC Plan Manager selection process; and (b) move forward with advancing the selection process based on the timeline outlined in this report.

Discussion:

A. Background

The Board, working together with its Ad Hoc DC Plan Manager Selection Committee (Committee) and staff, has taken a number of actions with respect to developing and filling the new Defined Contribution Plan Manager (DC Plan Manager) position. This position will provide executive staff leadership to the Deferred Compensation Plan (DCP). A summary of Board and Committee actions to date regarding the DC Plan Manager position is provided in **Attachment A**.

B. DC Plan Manager Examination Selection Process Update

The DC Plan Manager examination bulletin was issued on November 18, 2021. Applications were originally due December 9, 2021. This date was extended to December 16, 2021 due to the limited number of qualified applications received by the former due date. As a result of this seven-day extension, the eligible list for DC Plan Manager is expected to be finalized on or around January 14, 2022.

At its December 21, 2021 meeting, the Board discussed resources to support the City's DC Plan Manager examination process in the event civil service examination interviews were required.

The level of support may have included a Board member serving as an exam rater and/or solicitation of an outside rater. Subsequently, staff was informed by the Personnel Department's Selection Division that because the eligible list was expected to contain six or fewer candidates, civil service interviews for the DC Plan Manager position would not be needed. This is consistent with the practice found in similar exam processes with small numbers of eligible applicants. Accordingly, all six candidates will be assigned an identical score so that all candidates can proceed to the selection process. This will allow the DCP to move immediately to a certification selection process.

(1) Certification Selection Process

The Board's role in the selection process is to generate a recommendation for the DC Plan Manager position to the Personnel Department, assuming a viable candidate is identified. To facilitate its role in the screening process, staff has developed certain proposed processes, outlined in two stages, as follows:

Stage 1 – Experience and Skills Review

Staff has developed three proposed elements to help assess the candidates and reach a determination as to which candidates would be considered finalists for interviews by the Board. These elements are intended to assist both the Board and the candidates in the critical exchange of information about candidate skills as they relate to the requirements for the DC Plan Manager position.

- **Experience and Skills Review** – Defined contribution experience is a fundamental requirement of the DC Plan Manager position. Staff proposes that candidates be requested to submit a work and experience outline focused not just on the usual features of a resume (i.e. a chronology/summary of work duties) but also including a discussion of how that work experience relates to the requirements of the DC Plan Manager position. Staff proposes that a work experience questionnaire be developed by staff and the Committee for candidates to submit for review.
- **Advisory Essay** - Effective use of writing to analyze and communicate complex information, and develop thoroughly considered recommendations, is a fundamental requirement of the DC Plan Manager position. Advisory essays are useful tools for assessing a candidate's analytical and writing skills. Staff proposes that an advisory essay be developed by staff and the Committee for candidates to submit for review.
- **Position and Process Details Outline and Acknowledgement** – The ability to successfully execute the oversight and operational responsibilities of the DCP within the context of the City's unique organizational structure and processes is a fundamental requirement of the DC Plan Manager position. Staff proposes developing and providing the candidates with an outline of certain key aspects of both City and program processes in the form of a position and process outline to help inform the candidates and better prepare them in the event they are called for interviews with the Board. Candidates would only be asked to acknowledge the receipt and review of this material.

The questions and responses from the candidates would be provided to those Board members who will be participating in the selection process. The review of the materials would occur in a meeting of those Board members. If those Board members participating in the meeting comprised a quorum of the Board, the matter would be agendized as a meeting of the Board but consideration of the materials would be conducted in closed session. If the meeting was not of a quorum of the Board, a subsequent action by a quorum of the Board would be necessary to finalize the candidates who would proceed to interviews.

Stage 2 – Interviews

Interview questions will need to be developed for Board members to pose as part of the interview process. Staff proposes that interview questions be developed in advance by staff and the Committee for the Board.

As noted above, candidate interviews will need to occur in meetings of those Board members participating in the selection process. If those Board members participating in the interview meeting comprise a quorum of the Board, the matter would be agendized as a meeting of the Board but the interviews would be conducted in closed session. If the meeting was not of a quorum of the Board, a subsequent action by a quorum of the Board would be necessary to make a final recommendation to the Personnel Department.

Following the interviews, the Board would also have the option to conduct additional evaluation exercises (e.g. second-round interviews or other skills exercises) as part of its consideration prior to arriving at a recommendation. However, staff proposes that consideration of additional evaluation exercises be deferred until after the interviews have taken place.

(2) Timeline

Staff has developed the following tentative timeline for the previously described process elements. The dates and date ranges are targets and subject to Board member availability.

Tentative Date Range	Action
January 24-28, 2022	Development/finalization of materials for experience and skills review, advisory essay, and position and process details
January 31, 2022	Issuance of materials to candidates
February 7, 2022	Response due date from candidates
February 14-18, 2022	Meeting to review candidate materials and determination of finalists
February 22-March 4, 2022	Candidate interviews and selection recommendations

In summary, staff recommends that the Board (a) request that staff work with the Ad Hoc DC Plan Manager Selection Committee to develop a work experience questionnaire, advisory essay,

position and process outline, and interview questions, for use, as applicable, in the DC Plan Manager selection process; and (b) move forward with advancing the selection process based on the timeline outlined in this report.

C. DC Plan Manager Exemption and Recruitment Update

(1) Request to Exempt Position

In accordance with Board action at its December 21, 2021 meeting, staff is working with the Board Chairperson and City Attorney in developing a communication to the Office of the Mayor renewing the Board's request that the DC Plan Manager position be exempted from civil service. As previously noted to the Board, if this effort is successful, it would not preclude consideration of candidates from the examination process, but it could change the employment status of any individual who is appointed.

In addition, also following Board action at its December 21, 2021 meeting, staff conducted research regarding the Personnel Department's executive recruitment resources. Staff learned that, following a recent procurement, a group of four firms have been identified to provide executive recruitment services for City departments to fill executive or difficult to fill positions. Although contracts with these providers have yet to be finalized, upon execution they would be available as potential resources to assist the Board with recruitment of the DC Plan Manager position in the event that the examination selection process outlined in this report does not result in identifying a viable candidate. This work could be performed through execution of a work order and would not require a separate contract executed by the Board.

Finally, the Employee Benefits Division is still in the process of filling the Employee Benefits Division Chief position and vacant Senior Benefits Analyst II position. Updates will be provided to the Board as they are available.



Submitted by:

Steven Montagna, Chief Personnel Analyst

CHRONOLOGY OF DC PLAN MANAGER BOARD AND COMMITTEE ACTIONS

June 25, 2020	The Board of Civil Service Commissioners approved the creation of the new DC Plan Manager classification.
October 20, 2020	The Board approved staff recommendations with respect to recruitment and salary considerations for the DC Plan Manager position, including requesting exemption of the new position from civil service, requesting an unfreeze to fill the position, and setting the salary at the level of Chief Personnel Analyst.
April 14, 2021	The City Council approved an ordinance to establish the salary range of the DC Plan Manager classification at the level of Chief Personnel Analyst.
June 15, 2021	The Board established an Ad Hoc DC Plan Manager Selection Committee (Committee) to develop recommendations for the Board to make to the Personnel Department as to the design and content of the selection process.
July 7, 2021	The Committee met to consider certain materials drafted by staff, including proposed recruitment materials.
July 20, 2021	The Board requested that the Personnel Department initiate the examination development process if indication regarding the request for exempt status was not received from the Mayor's Office by July 23, 2021 (which it was not); and requested that the Personnel Department provide a response regarding elevating the DCP's Senior Benefits Analyst I position to Senior Benefits Analyst II.
August 17, 2021	The Board approved certain requests for submission with regards to the Fiscal Year (FY) 2022-23 proposed budget, including adding regular position authority for the DC Plan Manager position and requesting the Office of the City Administrative Officer (CAO), Employee Relations Division (ERD) to review and make a paygrade determination to elevate the Senior Benefits Analyst I to a Senior Benefits Analyst II position; the Board further authorized the Board Chairperson to approve any documents required to transmit the FY 2022-23 budget requests to the CAO and Office of the Mayor on behalf of the Board and requested that the Personnel Department submit the afore-noted requests to the Office of the Mayor. Materials were subsequently drafted and reviewed/approved by the Board Chairperson.
November 16, 2021	The Board modified its instructions to the Committee to request that it develop recommendations for the Board to make to the Personnel Department regarding conduct of the DC Plan Manager selection process up to and including execution of the final selection process and onboarding of the appointee; and further recommended to the Personnel Department General Manager that Steven Montagna be placed in-lieu of the DC Plan Manager position beginning on or around January 1, 2022 and ending with the appointment of a permanent DC Plan Manager but no later than April 29, 2022.
December 8, 2021	The Committee met to develop recommendations to the Board with respect to the selection process.
December 15, 2021	The Committee met to discuss consequences of the potentially small number of viable applications available to consider via the examination process.
December 21, 2021	The Board (a) authorize the Board Chairperson to, in consultation with staff, draft and submit a communication to the Office of the Mayor renewing the Board's request that the DC Plan Manager position be exempted from civil service; (b) request that staff develop a proposal for the most expedited process practical for securing the services of an executive recruiting firm; (c) recommend to the Personnel Department that the vacant Senior Benefits Analyst I position dedicated to the DCP be filled as soon as practical; (d) recommend to the Personnel Department that it, upon filling the Employee Benefits Division's successor Chief and Senior Benefits Analyst II positions, provide DCP administrative training to these staff so they can support the DCP until the permanent appointment of a DC Plan Manager; (e) solicit a Board member volunteer to serve as an examination rater and request that staff solicit participation from a comparable large plan executive administrator to serve, if available, as an additional rater for the DC Plan Manager examination; and (f) find that final selection interviews should be conducted by all Board members interested in participating.